By Carlos Xavier

Thesis:

- 1. Have NT gifts like prophecy, healing, tongues continued or ceased?
- 2. **IF** they continue, do claimants meet the biblical standards as we non-trinis understand them?

My goal today is not to spark the age-old debate whether spiritual gifts are real or not.

My goal is not to debate the office of a prophet or the meaning of words like *glossolalia*, known as "tongues."

My main focus is to take you through a brief history of spiritual gifts. With a focus on the beliefs and practices of groups and individuals who might have claimed them.

As I do this, try and keep in mind whether or not they are from "the one and the same spirit" that testifies:

- The Father as "the only true God";
- The Gospel as the future-coming KOG on earth;
- And the uniquely-**procreated**, therefore non-preexistent, human Son of God *from* the womb.

So my intent is not to "quench" or extinguish anyone's spirit, nor to treat prophecies from God with "contempt." (1Thess 5.19-20)

After all, we're all commanded to "earnestly pursue [and] desire spiritual gifts, especially" that of prophecy (1Cor 14.1). Which the Apostle Paul defines as "edification" by "exhortation and comfort," i.e., not predictive prophecy! 1Cor 14.3

"In fact," Paul goes on to say that "prophesying does **much more good** than speaking **foreign languages**, unless someone can help the church by explaining what you mean." **1Cor 14.5** CEV

From Apostolic to Church Fathers, 100-

The earliest Christian history is recorded by the so-called Church Fathers.

So it's important to give you a brief sketch of their beliefs and practices.

For the most part they were Gentile, former Greco-Roman philosophers, highly influenced by Platonism and Neoplatonism.

Historian Constantin Ackermann notes that "a CF of the first centuries...did not easily escape the influence of Platonism; even in the doctrinal views of the *ecclesiastically dogmatic* Irenaeus, **Platonic elements** break through here and there. None, however, instituted so thorough a comparison between Platonic and Christian dogmas, and brought out the **harmonious relation of Platonism to Christianity, so industriously** as Eusebius of Caesarea [the famous early church historian from the 4th century]. He calls Plato *the only Greek who has attained the porch of* (Christian) *truth*."¹

A Logos Bible Software blog entitled Take It from the Church Fathers: You Should Read Plato quotes "the famous professor of divinity" William Inge who "bemoans that if people would only read Greek philosophers like Plotinus they would understand better the real continuity between the old culture and the new religion, and they might realize the utter impossibility of excising Platonism from Christianity without tearing Christianity to pieces."²

Dr. Inge goes on to say that the earliest Christianity "from its very beginning was formed by a **confluence of Jewish and Hellenic** religious ideas."

The noted Harvard Prof. Dr. Henry Wolfson came to this same conclusion when he wrote that the conception of the Trinity was "a combination of Jewish monotheism and pagan polytheism except that to them [i.e., the CF] this combination was a good combination; in fact, it was to them an ideal combination of what is best in Jewish monotheism and of what is best in pagan polytheism, and consequently they gloried in it and pointed to it as evidence of their belief."

As proof Dr. Wolfson quotes one of the so-called Cappadocian Church Fathers and architects of what became known as the doctrine of the Trinity, Gregory of Nyssa:

"The truth passes in the mean between these two conceptions, **destroying each heresy**....The **Jewish dogma is destroyed** [i.e., the *Shema*!].

Dr. Wolfson quotes the last of the known CF, John of Damascus:

¹ The Christian element in Plato and the Platonic philosophy, p 21.

² https://blog.logos.com/2013/11/plato-christianity-church-fathers/

³ Oratio Catechetica 3.

"On the one hand, of the Jewish idea we have the unity of God's nature, and, on the other, of the **Greek, we have the distinction of hypostases**, and that only."

Another noted church historian, Will Durant, summed it all up when he wrote that "Christianity did not destroy paganism; it **adopted** it."⁵

Dr. Durant admitted that "Greek mysteries," "other pagan cultures" "and the mystic theosophy that made Neoplatonism and Gnosticism...obscured the Christian creed." So much so that he called Orthodox Christianity "the last great creation of the ancient pagan world."

As a result, the CFs theology is a mishmash of unitarian, binitarian and gnostic beliefs.

For example, Irenaeus in his ironically titled *Against Heresies* says "there is none other called God by the Scriptures except the Father of all, **and** the Son."

Yet many Protestants still contend that Christians "owe the early church fathers a great debt, not only for shaping the future character of the Christian faith but also for getting it right." That's because "even the early Gnostics had at least one doctrine right."

By the "one doctrine" the author here refers to their teaching and practice of spiritual gifts.

The first thing to note, however, is the fact that most CFs did not claim to have the gifts. That's because they believed that not every Christian was so gifted.

For example, Hippolytus of Rome writing in the 2nd century:

"It is **not necessary** that every one of the faithful should cast out demons, raise the dead, or **speak with tongues**."

Ambrose, bishop of Milan, writing around the 4th century said that "the whole of the divine gifts cannot exist in each [*sic*] man."

This didn't mean that the CFs were against spiritual gifts *per se*, even though they focused on **predictive** prophecy. Many of them claimed to be a witness of the churches at that time.

The best known prophetic group was known as the Montanists. Dubbed the *New Prophecy Movement* they believed that they alone were spiritually gifted.

⁴ De Fide Orth. 1, 7.

⁵ Caesar and Christ: The Story of Civilization, vol. 3, p 565, 1944.

⁶ Ibid, p 595.

⁷ Pentecost To The Present: Book One.

⁸ *Apostolic Constitutions*, book 8.

⁹ On the Duties of the Clergy, 2.150.

So it's not a surprise to find CFs like Irenaeus describing them as "Wretched men indeed! Who wish to be **pseudo-prophets**...who set aside the gift of prophecy from the Church; [holding] themselves aloof from the communion of the brethren."

The Apollinarians, an early heretical group, said that their founder, Montanus, "supposes he might at first act by the operation of God; but whether it were so, or by that of the devil transformed, it was in such a manner that **nobody was able to discern, because both his life and doctrine were holy and blameless.**" ¹¹

The Church historian Eusebius described Montanus' spiritual experience as a sudden "frenzy and ecstasy, he raved, and began to babble and utter strange things, prophesying in a manner contrary to the constant custom of the Church handed down by tradition from the beginning." ¹²

Origen quotes a pagan writer called Celsius who witnessed Montanist prophets who "go on to add **incomprehensible**, **incoherent**, and utterly **obscure utterances**, the meaning of which no intelligent person could discover; for they are **meaningless and nonsensical**, and give a chance for any fool or sorcerer to take the words in whatever sense he likes."¹³

St. Gregory, the bishop of New Caesarea and former student of Origen, was dubbed "the wonderworker" (213-70). Historian Jeff Oliver says about him that "Besides his normal regiment of prophesying, healing the sick, and casting out demons, Gregory reportedly moved mountains, dried up lakes, redirected rivers, and banished pagan gods."¹⁴

"Where shall I rank the great Gregory, and the words uttered by him?" asked Basil of Caesarea, one of the Cappadocian Fathers, "Shall we not place among apostles and prophets a man who walked by **the same Spirit as they**?By the **superabundance of gifts**, wrought in him **by the Spirit** in all power and in signs and in marvels, he was styled **a second Moses** by the very enemies of the church." ¹⁵

¹⁰ Against Heresies 3.11.9.

¹¹ Lacy, *The General Delusion of Christians*, p 237.

¹² Eusebius, *Church History* 5.16.7.

¹³ Contra Celsus 7.9.

¹⁴ Oliver, Pentecost to the Present, p 77.

¹⁵ The Book of St. Basil on the Spirit, vol. 8.

From Dark to Catholic age, 1000-

The further away we move from the early apostolic church age, the less talk there is about the gifts.

But the rise of Catholicism, bringing the papacy into its socio-political supremacy, reignited the ancient interest in gifts. Unlike the early church focus on **predictive** prophecy, the Catholics turned to what became known as "speaking in tongues."

One of the best known Catholic saints was Hildegard of Bingen (1098 - 1179). She was said to have spoken and sung in what she called a *Lingua Ignota*, an "unknown language." A self-proclaimed visionary and prophetess, she described her songs as "concerts in the spirit." She said her visions were "the reflection of the living Light. And as the sun, the moon, and the stars appear in water, so writings, sermons, virtues, and **certain human actions** take form for me and gleam." 16

A Franciscan friar named Anthony of Padua, a companion to Saint Francis himself, was described as a "marvelous vessel of the holy spirit." While preaching in the Roman Catholic Council, aka the *Consistory*, "before the Pope and the Cardinals [and] others of all the different languages in the world," he was suddenly "enkindled by the Holy Spirit, expounded to them the Word of God so efficaciously, so devoutly...so sweetly, so clearly, and so persuasively, that all those who were in the Consistory, although of so many different languages, understood his words clearly and distinctly, as if he had spoken in each man's native tongue." ¹⁷

¹⁶ https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Hildegard of Bingen

Devotions to the glorious S. Anthony of Padua, eds. Sanghee, Browne, p 58f.

From Reformation to Pentecostalism, 1500-

Dr. Nathan Ogan in his book *Glossolalia* (p 40) notes that "during the Protestant Reformation members of revivalistic movements **frequently spoke in tongues**."

The list is surprisingly long including followers of the Moravians, the Camisards aka "French prophets," Quakers, Baptists, and even Methodists.

John Wesley himself noted an account of a revival meeting in 1759 where "Both adults and children fell under the power of the Spirit. They shrieked, swooned, fell to the floor as if dead, babbled senselessly, cried out in praise of God..."

The most famous individual during this time was 15 year old Margaret MacDonald. She described her visions of Christ's second coming as a "fiery trial" that was "for the purging and purifying of the real members of the church."

MacDonald's story came to the attention of another seminal figure during this time, the Scottish Rev. Edward Irving.

Irving's long fascination with the gifts, especially predictive prophecy, led him to a book on the end-times by a little-known Catholic Jesuit priest named Manuel Lacunza. The book claimed "new discoveries" similar to Margaret's visions. At the time, Irving held a series of prophecy conferences that further spread these beliefs.

Professor of history Keith Sewell, in his book *The Crisis of Evangelical Christianity*, notes that "Irving became convinced that the now imminent *latter days* would be marked by a restoration of the *charismata*, or miraculous gifts, such as **speaking in tongues** and prophecy. [Some] of his followers in Scotland are said to have received **the gift of tongues in 1830**, which **Irving certainly thought were actual human languages**. In this circle the *baptism of the Holy Spirit* came to be **distinguished**....Through all of this, Irving's **Christology remained highly problematic**: he believed in the **sinfulness of Christ's human nature**. Irving was eventually **deposed from the ministry of the Church of Scotland**. [His] followers eventually formed the **Catholic Apostolic Church**."

According to the *New Advent Catholic Encyclopedia* online "The specialty of their religious belief consists in this: They hold apostles, prophets, evangelists, and pastors (Ephesians 4:11-14) to be abiding ministries in the Church, and that these ministries, together with the power and gifts of the Holy Ghost, [are] dispensed and distributed among her members." And they of course hold to the Nicene and Athanasian Creeds. ¹⁸

_

¹⁸ http://catholicencyclopedia.newadvent.com/cathen/08174a.htm

Irving's teachings captured the interest of the Plymouth Brethren whose leaders included the noted John Darby. Some historians refer to Darby as the father of modern-day Pentecostalism and dispensationalism.

John Darby, who at the time used the relatively new term "rapture," would later export these beliefs and practices to the New World. They would later fuel the 20th century phenomenon known as pre-tribulation, secret rapture. This was most famously popularized by *The Left Behind* series of books and movies.

One notable difference between these early groups and later Pentecostalism was their belief that gifts had ceased sometime before the close of the Apostolic age. They had returned to the Church through individuals like MacDonald and groups led by Irving and Darby.

Sewell argues that "the ramifications [of these proto-Pentecostal movements] have been serious. Millions of evangelicals have given up [on] creation and culture. Their prime focus is not on being faithful servants of Jesus Christ in every area of life, but on being *rapture ready*, if necessary, *prophetic clocks* will be devised, started, stopped and re-started, as required to make the system work....Popular premillennial dispensationalist writing is strewed with false predictions of the pending date of *the rapture*. The media noise made by those concerned, coupled with the repeated confounding of prediction after prediction, serves to provide the secular and skeptical media of the western world—and the biblically illiterate masses they influence—with ready-made excuses not to take the Christian message seriously." 19

_

¹⁹ Sewell, p 102.

Excursus: Non-trinitarian groups

It might also surprise some of you to know that groups who shared these beliefs and practices included non-trinitarians.

The earliest known were the so-called Shakers, aka as Ranters, mainly former Quakers.

This article from the *Boston Post*, dated 1881, titled "facts concerning these strange people" said that "The most successful communists [not *political* Communists] in the world…over 5000 of them and, as families, they have existed for more than 100 years. [They] believe that the 2nd coming of Christ was made manifest in the person of Ann Lee, their founder….They believe that the present time is the millennium of 1000 years, and that a tenth part of it has already passed. [They believe] that it would be improper to marry and they therefore dwell together as brothers and sisters, living as celibates."

They also believed in spirit mediums and that all Shakers were sinless, probably an early form of what came to be known as *sinless perfection*.

The newspaper goes on to describe in detail one of their meetings:

"After the good elders' sermon, which generally consumes about 30 or 40 minutes time, the Shakers rise and again all march around the room singing as they go. All at once as suddenly [someone] collapsed...the spirit moves some brother or sister....Immediately the marching ceases. Brother Vance relates his experience, followed by one brother after another until perhaps a score have told of the good things the Lord has done for them."

Next were the Mormons who, you might also be surprised to know, practiced the gifts.

To this day their 7th Article of Faith reads:

"We believe in **the gift of tongues**, prophecy, revelation, visions, healing, interpretation of tongues, and so forth."

The doctrine was introduced by founder Joseph Smith's successor Brigham Young in the early 1800s.

In his journal, Young recounts an event that occurred while visiting with "the Prophet" Smith and others:

"In my prayer I spoke in tongues. As soon as we arose from our knees the brethren flocked around him [Joseph Smith], and asked his opinion concerning **the gift of tongues** that was upon me. He told them that it was **the pure Adamic language**. Some said to him they expected he would condemn the gift brother Brigham had, but he said, **No, it is of God.**" ²⁰

²⁰ https://www.dialoguejournal.com/wp-content/uploads/sbi/articles/Dialogue_V24N01_15.pdf

Writing of the same event Joseph Smith wrote in his journal:

"I received a visit from Elders Joseph Young, Brigham Young [and others]. They spent 4 or 5 days [with me] during which we had many **interesting moments**. At one of our interviews, Brother Brigham Young and John P. Greene **spoke in tongues, which was the first time I had heard this gift among the brethren**: others also spoke, and **I received the gift myself**."²¹

²¹ History of Church, Vol. I, pp. 296-97.

From Pentecostalism to Today: 1900 -

According to the last Pew Research poll there were close to 600 million Christian so-called charismatics.

That was almost 10 years ago now.

"This means that, according to this analysis, pentecostal and charismatic Christians together make up about 27% of all Christians and more than 8% of the world's total population."²²

As of today, 2020, the number is nearing 1 billion worldwide.

Most of these people remain Catholics followed by Protestants and then non-trinitarians like Oneness, aka Modalists and Mormons.

According to the *International Dictionary of Charismatic and Pentecostal Movements* these people "seek a postconversion religious experience called **baptism in the Holy Spirit**....which may include **instantaneous sanctification** [or sinless perfection], the ability to prophesy, to practice divine healing through prayer, to speak in tongues or to interpret tongues, **singing in tongues**, **singing in the Spirit**, dancing in the Spirit, dreams, visions, discernment of spirits, words of wisdom, words of knowledge, miracles, **power encounters**, exorcisms (casting out demons), resuscitations [i.e., raise the dead], deliverances, signs and wonders."

The purpose of this movement says the *Dictionary* "was to deny the *cessation of the charismata* teaching that had been the <u>standard understanding of the Western churches since the days of Augustine</u>."

The roots of modern-day Pentecostalism go back to the 19th century so-called *Holiness Movement* of the Methodists, the 1901 Topeka revival and more famously the 1906 *Azusa Street* revival in LA, Ca.

The KS revival took place in *Bethel Bible College* in the city of Topeka when Agnes Ozman reportedly started to speak *and* write in Chinese.

A couple of years later, sister Agnes tried to alert others "to what I am sure God showed me was error," she later wrote. "That tongues was not the only evidence of the Spirit's Baptism."

She said that after the "baptism I got into spiritual darkness, because I did as I see so many others are doing these days, rested and reveled in tongues and other demonstrations instead of resting alone in God."²³

²² https://www.pewforum.org/2011/12/19/global-christianity-movements-and-denominations/# ftnrefmove1

²³ "When The Latter Rain First Fell: The First One to Speak in Tongues". In The Latter Rain Evangel, January 1909, p.2.

Agnes' pastor was *Bethel Bible College* founder Charles Parham, a former Methodist preacher. The Reverend, as he was known, was an **ardent** follower of the Methodist *Holiness Movement* introduced by John Wesley in the 1800s.

Parham had to close his *Church College* after only 2 years and started travelling the country preaching what he termed "holy spirit baptism."

After the death of the popular Scottish evangelist John Dowie, another self-proclaimed prophet, Parham tried to take over his *Christian Catholic Apostolic Church* in Zion City, Illinois.

According to an article in *The Topeka Daily Herald* Parham claimed "that God appeared to him in a dream two weeks ago and told him that Voliva [the new leader of the *Catholic Apostolic Church*] was a **false prophet** and would lead the people of Zion into ruin. Ten days ago Parham says that *the spirit* again **appeared to him** at Topeka and commanded him at once to go to Zion and combat the **evil influences** of Voliva."

By the way, we should thank Wilbur Voliva, a radical Christian fundamentalist, for reigniting the current Flat Earth craze that's spreading.

Picture slide:

"No one except a lowdown scoundrel, a person lower than the dirtiest dog, yes lower down than a skunk would call the earth a globe in Zion City."

But I digress.

Newspaper articles and medical journals of the time report the "**shocking fanaticism**" of Parham's followers, dubbed the *Parhamites*, during his time in Zion City.

Now I must warn you that some of what you're about to hear is very graphic!

This San Francisco Call newspaper article from 1907 reads in part:

"Five persons, members of the sect of Parhamites, are under arrest in Zion City accused of torturing to death Mrs. Letitia Greenhaulgh, 64 years old, a cripple for 20 years, in order to show belief in the religion they profess. [Its members believe] in the gift of tongues and especially in diabolical possession. It is their theory that sickness is an evidence of the possession of the body by evil spirits. The arms of Mrs. Greenhaulgh, stiffened by rheumatism, were jerked and twisted about in order that the devil might be driven out. The cries of the aged woman were considered to be those of an evil spirit and were greeted with triumphant shouts....Then her neck was twisted and for some time this treatment was kept up."

A 1908 Kansas City Medical Index noted that "in their efforts [the Parhamites] absolutely **broke the bones** of the poor woman."

This article from the *Democrat Chronicle* from 1907 reported another case of a child who "was tortured to drive out devils."

"The boy suffered with typhoid fever, but his parents, who were Parhamites, are alleged to have denied him medical attendance. Instead he was subjected to the treatment of driving out devils and the gift of tongues. Those who were at his bedside when he died, assert that he cried [in a pitiful manner] for water, which was refused, the fanatics telling him that the Lord would provide water. They are also said to have thrust their finders down his throat to reach the devils that were tormenting him. When death put an end to his torture it is alleged that his tongue was found to have been slit as though with a knife."

The *International Dictionary of Charismatics* says that "For a brief period [Pentecostalism] was a charismatic revival that **expected to remain an interdenominational movement** within the existing churches, without beginning a new denomination. But from **1909** onward **its members were increasingly ejected from all mainline bodies** and so were forced to begin new organized denominations."

Today, the largest group called the *Assemblies of God*, has **more than 70 million** adherents as of **2019!** This is a **majority trinitarian** group whose beliefs and practices include "baptism in the holy spirit"; "speaking in tongues" **as evidence for your salvation**; and other traditional Orthodox beliefs like the immortal soul, eternal hell, etc.

The largest church is in South Korea, founded in the 1950s and is nearing 1 million members.

Their English website has as their statement of faith what they call the Fivefold Gospel model.

The first is called "The Gospel of Regeneration (Salvation)," i.e., "Jesus Christ has saved them through the cross, and accepts Him as their Savior."

The second is "The Gospel of Heaven and the Second Coming" which teaches that "heaven is prepared for believers after death."

The last one is called *The Threefold Blessing* teaching "prosperity in soul [and] in all things."

Catholic journalist John L. Allen Jr. says:

"Perhaps the most controversial element of the Pentecostal outlook is the so-called *prosperity* gospel, meaning the belief that God will reward those with sufficient faith with both material prosperity and physical health. [The] Pew Forum data suggests that the prosperity gospel is actually a defining feature of all Pentecostalism; majorities of Pentecostals exceeding 90 percent in most countries hold to these beliefs."²⁴

_

²⁴ The Future Church, pp 382-83.

This book was first published in 2009! More than 10 years ago now so today's numbers will **definitely** be higher.

For more on the history of gifts see *The Gift of Tongues Project* page: https://charlesasullivan.com/

And the podcast and YouTube channel by https://longfortruth.com/

Summary

The Apostle Paul says there are "different kinds of spiritual gifts but the same Spirit" (1Cor 12.4), just like there is "one body and one spirit" (Eph. 4.4).

This one Spirit produces all the gifts, distributing them to each member of the one body as God wills it (1Cor 12:11).

He adds that "all the members do not have the same function [and] since we have gifts that differ according to the grace given to us; each member is to exercise them accordingly." **Rom 12:4-6**

The Apostle Peter notes that each Christian has a responsibility "as a good manager of God's different gifts, to use **for the good of others** the special gift he has received from God." **1Pet 4.10**

So if you believe the Spirit is active *irrespective* of beliefs and practices, how will this serve *the good of others* who **do not share** said beliefs and practices?

In other words, we know that in general Trinitarian and Oneness claimants do not even consider us part of the body of Christ.

So how would their practice of spiritual gifts be for our benefit?

I think that's why Paul commands the pursuit of wisdom and discernment, defined by him as the *ability to distinguish between spirits*. (1Cor 12.10)

This is essential in order to act upon the warnings we find scattered throughout the Bible. From the Old to the New Testament:

Deut. 13:1 "Suppose there are prophets among you or those who dream dreams about the future, and they promise you signs or miracles, and **the predicted signs or miracles occur**." NLT

Matthew 7:22 "Many will say to me on that day, *Lord, Lord, we prophesied in your name, drove out demons in your name, and performed many miracles in your name, didn't we?*"

Now Jesus did not say to them, Oh no you didn't!

But instead I never knew you. Get away from me, you who practice evil!

Paul in 2 Thessalonians 2 warns that this same evil will come "according to the working of Satan in all power and signs and wonders."

NOTE the **contrast** between the "power, signs and wonders" of the gifts of the Spirit in **Hebrews 2:4** with "the working of Satan" that will occur during the end days.

The fact is that the satanic **counterfeit** will be so effective that it will camouflage the deception that will ensnare, "if possible," Jesus warns, "even the elect" (**Mat 24.24**)!

Yet, "no wonder," warns Paul, "For Satan disguises himself as an angel of light. So it does not surprise us if Satan's servants make themselves look like servants who work for what is right." **2Cor 11.14-15**a

Furthermore, we know that the gifts served to **confirm** what the Spirit taught regarding Who God and Jesus are and what is their Gospel.

We began our Brief History of Spiritual Gifts with 2 key questions:

- 1. Have NT gifts like prophecy, healing, tongues continued or ceased?
- 2. **IF** they continued, do claimants meet the biblical standards as we non-trinis understand them?

I hope that this presentation will have answered those questions for you.

IF not, I hope that it instills a renewed interest in further study, research and perhaps more questions of your own.

http://thehumanjesus.org/